AN ASSESSMENT OF SLOW CITIES AS SUSTAINABLE TOURISM TOOLS IN THE CONTEXT OF HISTORICAL URBAN LANDSCAPE APPROACH: CASES IN TURKEY

Aysun Tuna
Assistant Professor
Faculty of Fine Arts and Design, Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University, Battalgazi, Malatya, Türkiye
aysun.tuna@inonu.edu.tr

Hulisi Binbasioglu
Assistant Professor
Department of Tourism and Hotel Management, Malatya Turgut Özal University
Kale, Malatya, Türkiye
hulusi.binbasioglu@ozal.edu.tr

Bilge Hatun Ay
Graduate Student
Faculty of Fine Arts and Design, Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University, Battalgazi, Malatya, Türkiye
bilgehatunay01@gmail.com

Abstract
Historical urban landscapes encompass the social and cultural practices of the built environment and the communities that interact with them, as well as the values and meanings community attached to the built environment. In this context, historical urban landscapes are the sources of information that have been shaped and developed by the societies with the tangible and intangible characteristics that extend to today. Now, these sources of information are at risk in terms of concepts such as rapid urbanization and industrialization. This issue necessitates the development of strategies for the preservation of historic urban landscapes. Cittaslow movement is nowadays on the agenda of the world as an alternative to the negative effects of rapidly operating cities, where people live in a very fast pace, and consume more than they produce as a result of the globalization. The purpose of Cittaslow basically offers an alternative and quality lifestyle to the communities by resisting the loss of identity in the cities the post-globalization era where uncontrolled growth, uniformity of the lifestyle of the society and the loss of cultural values and the resulting unidentified identity. Therefore, the Cittaslow has the similar aims with the sustainable tourism approach that is based on the approach of protecting and developing natural and cultural landscape resource values of the region where it exists economically, ecologically and environment-friendly. In this paper, the tools and action plans outlined in the UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach recommendation are examined and the 14 residential sites participating in the Cittaslow network will be studied. Qualitative analysis method will be employed in this study. Practices made on the basis of data received from the relevant local administrations of Cittaslow will be examined in the context of historic urban landscape approach tools. Present situations have been primarily stated to carry out the Cittaslow criteria in the settlements involved in the union of Cittaslow in Turkey in this paper.
After membership, the projects developed by local administrations within the scope of Cittaslow movement, have been evaluated in the intersection of sustainable tourism and historical urban landscape, and the influences of the implementations on Cittaslow have been set forth.

Keywords: sustainable tourism, historical urban landscape, Cittaslow

Introduction

Slow city movement started in 1986 at the opening of McDonald’s, held at Spanish Stairs in Rome, to make a protest by throwing plates of Italian macaroni by the group led by the gastronomy journalist Carlo Petrini with the notion that “city square aesthetics would be damaged and eating is not feeding with junk food”. Following the establishment of “Slow Food Guild” in the Barolo City of Italy, the Guild had attained an international characteristic in Paris in 1989 (Karadeniz, 2014; Üzümçü et al, 2016). This counteraction, shaped spontaneously and called as “slow food”, has spread gradually and become a movement fed by a common slowness cognizance, not only in food but also in living, travelling, education, reading, money and other fields during the following years. This movement was developed as a “slow city movement” and gained an institutional identity. According to the Cittaslow International Charter (2009), Cittaslow is “non-profit entities and their objectives are to promote and spread the culture of good living through research, testing and application of solutions for the city organization”. Cittaslow Charter provides suggestions to reduce many negative effects of globalization including monotony and standardization by popularizing the sustainable development principles in cities. Nilsson et al., (2011) express the purpose of the Cittaslow charter as both improving life quality of city dwellers and creating guest- friendly cities and protecting and improving cultural heredity, architecture and traditions. Mayer & Knox (2006) define the slow city as an alternative urban development cognizance and positioned it against the main movement urban development cognizance. Radstrom (2011) emphasizes that the slowness concept corresponds to better life quality, transcending from slow movement. On the other hand, Honore (2008) states that slowness does not mean quiescence or provinciality but, on the contrary, it means protecting the traditions and adapting the good sides of the modern world to the end.

The framework of the code consists of the establishment and organs of Cittaslow Charter and the structure of these organs and the terms to be fulfilled by member cities to become a member of the Charter. These terms, called as Cittaslow criteria, are a list specifying plans, projects, organizations and programs that need to be attained by a city to become a member of Cittaslow Charter. These criteria are described in sub-articles under the main headings of energy and environmental policies, infrastructural policies, quality of urban policies, agricultural and touristic and artisan policies, social cohesion and partnership (Table 1). The requirement for the city population to be less than 50 thousand has been emphasized in the membership process (Keskin, 2012).

The criteria, to be fulfilled to become a member of “slow city” and included in Table 1, will prompt the existing tourism potential of a region as well as ensure sustainability of tourism activities by promoting the protection of its existing tourism potential. Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC) forms 32 sustainability criteria under four main headings to achieve sustainability in the tourism sector and designate the social responsibility of the sector, its environmental interactions and negative and positive economic and cultural effects. These criteria are listed under four headings, namely policies of sustainable administration systems, policies of socio-economic effects, policies of cultural interaction, and policies of environmental interaction (Global Sustainable Tourism Council, 2018). Güneș et al. (2015) describe the
common relations between the criteria of sustainable tourism and being a slow city by using the quantitative design method in their study. They conclude the results of their study that the sustainable tourism criteria and slow city criteria are parallel to each other and environmental and social policies have common characteristics.

**Historical Urban Landscape Approach**

The requirement for adapting some factors is prominent in the sustainable protection of historical landscapes including the interaction between natural and structured environments, historical cities to become the subject of new developments due to the layering of old and new city dynamics, popularization of modern architecture in historical sites and development of awareness for this, considering that change of economy and city roles occurs through micro and macro scale tourism strategies, the concepts of specificity and completeness to become prominent for the protection of living historical landscapes, use of the buffer zone concept as a protection strategy, and moral values (Tuna, 2016). The historical city landscape recommendation of UNESCO, suggesting the development of the practice of a new city heredity protection that is able to cope with today’s globalization dynamics, was approved by the UNESCO General Assembly on 10/11/2011 (UNESCO, 2011).

The recommendation submits a landscape approach, considering the relations between physical forms, spatial organizations and connections, natural features and positions and social, cultural and economic values within a larger city concept to designate, protect and manage historical areas. This approach consists of the issues of policy, administration and management where various partners participate, including local, national, regional, international, public and private actors in the city development process and develop the approach of “holistic urban protection” (UNESCO, 2011). The recommendation defines historical city landscape instruments and action plans for accomplishing these criteria and integrating them with the approach of city heredity protection (Table 2). These instruments have been set as civic participation, informing and planning and regulating systems and financial instruments. The instruments aim to achieve spatial and temporal sustainability of the settlement identity, which is a part of city heredity. These instruments can be defined as elements, which shape protection codes by directing the interventions and achieving employment by encouraging participation for the protection of society and hence, contributing to the regional economy and which need to be integrated into city planning (Tuna, 2016b).

It is seen that the criteria, which are necessary to be a slow city, are parallel to each other by comparing the Cittaslow criteria and historical city landscape approach. Cittaslow movement, based on the main target of achieving sustainability of local identity, denotes activation of historical city landscape instruments, which are necessary to protect cultural heredity and integrate it into the city planning process. In this context, it can be concluded that a settlement, included in Cittaslow charter and have the title of slow city, has fulfilled the main criteria defined in UNESCO’s recommendation and has committed to fulfill them.

It is crucial for the destinations to carry their tourism activities with sustainable development principles in cities. The aim of this study to research the Cittaslaws in Turkey if they meet the criteria of UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach in the context of sustainable tourism. There are many studies about both sustainable tourism and Cittaslow. But there is no research studying Cittaslaws with meeting the criteria of UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach. Because it is the first study to investigate the Cittaslaws in Turkey in the frame of UNESCO Historical Urban Landscape Approach, it is thought that this study will contribute to the literature.
Table 1: The Cittaslow Membership Process Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENTAL POLICIES</th>
<th>AGRICULTURAL, TURISTIC AND ARTISAN POLICIES</th>
<th>INFRASTRUCTURAL POLICIES</th>
<th>POLICIES FOR HOSPITALITY, AWARENESS AND TRAINING</th>
<th>QUALITY OF URBAN LIFE</th>
<th>SOCIAL COHESION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Air quality conservation*</td>
<td>Development of agro-ecology**</td>
<td>Efficient cycle paths connected to public buildings</td>
<td>Good welcome (training of people in charge, signs, suitable infrastructure and hours)*</td>
<td>Planning for urban resilience**</td>
<td>Minorities discriminated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water quality conservation*</td>
<td>Protection of handmade and labelled artisan production (certified, museums of culture, etc.)*</td>
<td>Length (in kms) of the urban cycle paths created over the total of kms of urban roads*</td>
<td>Increasing awareness of operators and traders (transparency of offers and practiced prices, clear visibility of tariffs)*</td>
<td>Interventions of recovery and increasing the value of civic centers (street furniture, tourist signs, aerials, urban landscape mitigation conservation*)</td>
<td>Enclave / neighbors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drinking water consumption of residents</td>
<td>Increasing the value of working techniques and traditional crafts*</td>
<td>Bicycle parking in interchange zones</td>
<td>Availability of “slow” itineraries (printed, web, etc.)</td>
<td>Recovery/creation of social green areas with productive plants and/or fruit trees**</td>
<td>Integration of disable people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban solid separate waste collection*</td>
<td>Increasing the value of rural areas (greater accessibility to resident services)*</td>
<td>Planning of eco-mobility as an alternative to private cars*</td>
<td>Adoption of active techniques suitable for launching bottom-up processes in the more important administrative decisions</td>
<td>Urban livableness (“house-work, nursery, company hours, etc.”)</td>
<td>Children care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial and domestic composting*</td>
<td>Use of local products, if possible organic, in communal public restaurants (school canteens, etc.)*</td>
<td>Removal of architectural barriers*</td>
<td>Permanent training of trainers and /or administrators and employees on Cittaslow slow themes**</td>
<td>Requalification and reuse of marginal areas*</td>
<td>Youth condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purification of sewage disposal*</td>
<td>Prohibiting the use of GMO in agriculture</td>
<td>Initiatives for family life and pregnant women*</td>
<td>Health education (battle against obesity, diabetes, etc.)</td>
<td>Use of ICT in the development of interactive services for citizens and tourists*</td>
<td>Poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy saving in buildings and public systems</td>
<td>Good ideas for enforcing plans concerning land settlements previously used for agriculture</td>
<td>Verified accessibility to medical services</td>
<td>Systematic and permanence information for the citizens regarding the meaning of Cittaslow (even pre-emptively on adherence)*</td>
<td>Minorities discriminated</td>
<td>Community association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public energy production from renewable sources</td>
<td>New ideas for enforcing plans concerning land settlements previously used for agriculture</td>
<td>“Sustainable” distribution of merchandise in urban centers</td>
<td>The active presence of associations operating with the administration on Cittaslow themes</td>
<td>Recovery/creation of social green areas with productive plants and/or fruit trees**</td>
<td>Multicultural integration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduction of visual pollution, traffic noise</td>
<td>Support for Cittaslow campaigns*</td>
<td>Percentage of residents that commutes daily to work in another town*</td>
<td>Support for Cittaslow campaigns*</td>
<td>Requalification and reuse of marginal areas*</td>
<td>Political participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduction of public light pollution*</td>
<td>Insertion/use of the Cittaslow logo on headed paper and website*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Use of ICT in the development of interactive services for citizens and tourists*</td>
<td>Public housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical energy consumption of resident families</td>
<td>The existence of youth activity areas, and a youth center</td>
<td>Conservation of biodiversity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The existence of youth activity areas, and a youth center</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Historical Urban Landscape (HUL) toolkits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Civic Engagement Tools</th>
<th>Knowledge and Planning Tools</th>
<th>Regulatory Tools</th>
<th>Financial Tools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Accessible, multiplatform urban planning vision process</td>
<td>- The holistic planning process that incorporates urban heritage &amp; values</td>
<td>- Zoning ordinance underpinned by urban heritage database</td>
<td>- Private Public Partnership targeted funding for Urban Heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Public forums about aspects of the urban future</td>
<td>- Documentation of tangible &amp; intangible community heritage</td>
<td>- Conservation easement law</td>
<td>- Public Capital Improvements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Web-based local heritage games</td>
<td>- Urban viewscape mapping for building envelope, height, location</td>
<td>- Historic district commission law</td>
<td>- Ongoing Public Maintenance Staffing &amp; Budgets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Urban heritage issues web exchange blogs, chat rooms</td>
<td>- Planning for the conservation of natural &amp; cultural resources</td>
<td>- Traditional, customary systems, indigenous peoples</td>
<td>- Private Building &amp; Property Maintenance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Planning charrettes with open dialogue</td>
<td>- Targeted urban preservation, management, tourism plans</td>
<td>- Legislated climate change targets</td>
<td>- Purchase Y Resale with Conservation Restrictions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Documentation projects, oral interviews, videos</td>
<td>- Green infrastructure knowledge applied with heritage considered</td>
<td>- Tree protection ordinance</td>
<td>- Revolving Loan Fund addressing Historic Structures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Community heritage stewardship skill development, workshops, projects</td>
<td>- Plans incorporating heritage values to address streets, public facilities, storm-water, parks, etc.</td>
<td>- Green Infrastructure, Renewable Energy Codes</td>
<td>- Long-Term Lease of Heritage Properties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Volunteer efforts to sustain local historic places</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Multi-purpose overlay districts, for the economy, heritage, aesthetics, conservation</td>
<td>- Mutual Covenants</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* = Obligatory requirement  ** = Perspective requirements


Papers from The 11th Tourism Outlook Conference
2-5 October 2018, Eskişehir, Turkey
Copyright: CC: NC-BY-ND-SA
Material and Method
The qualitative research method was selected in this paper not to consider the selected subject as separate from human and the process and to facilitate access to information. Multiple case study was applied for choosing the slow cities. The data was collected by face-to-face and email environment interviews with local administration representatives. A literature search was conducted during the study and brochures, CDs, catalogues, articles, books, thesis and projects on the subject were reviewed and the necessary information was collected. Furthermore, a detailed internet search was performed to access up-to-date information.

There are 236 Cittaslows in 30 countries in the world and 15 of the Cittaslows are in Turkey. The Slow City Movement in Turkey started on November 28, 2009, when Seferihisar of Izmir City was included in Slow City charter as the first city of Turkey and the 129th city of the world. As a result of the studies conducted to popularize this movement in Turkey, Taraklı (Sakarya), Gökçeada (Çanakkale), Yenipazar (Aydın), Yalvaç (İsparta), and Akyaka (Muğla) have earned the title of slow city in 2011, Vize (Kırklareli) and Perşembe (Ordu) in 2012, Halfeti (Şanlıurfa) in 2013, Şavşat (Artvin) in 2015, Uzundere (Erzurum), Eğirdir (İsparta), Göynük (Bolu), and Gerze (Sinop) in 2017, and Mudurnu (Bolu) in 2018 (CittaslowTürkiye, 2018). Because Mudurnu has just earned this title, it could not possible to collect data from this Cittaslow. So, in the current paper, there are 14 Cittaslows to study.

Results
Natural and cultural landscape resource values of the mentioned slow cities in Turkey, activities conducted in the area, local gastronomy, local economic resources and projects performed by the local administrations during and after the Cittaslow membership process are outlined in Table 3. The data shown in Table 3 were collected by interviews held with the authorized technical team of local administrations involved in the follow up of the process.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Natural and cultural landscape resource</th>
<th>Local gastronomy and festivals</th>
<th>Local economic resources</th>
<th>Projects performed by the local administrations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beaches (in West, Azmak, KüçükAkkuş, BüyükAkkuş, Akarca, Ekmeksiz, Bahadır, Çiftkalesi; in South, PayamliDoğanbey, İpekkm and Urkmez), Thermals-thermae (Doğanbey, Tuzla, Karakoç, Cumalı, Uyuz, Ahmetçi, Gelinboğan, Hamamönü), Wetlands (Azmak), Agricultural lands (Ulumş-Düze-Seferihisar plains, Doğanbey-Payamlı-Urkmez plains), Forested lands (forested areas around Gödence, Beyler, and small forest area in Teos), Rivers and dams (major rivers such as Ulamış creek, Yassıçay, Karakoç, and Seferihisar, Kavakdere, Urkmez dams), Ancient settlements (Teos, Herakleia, Lebedos, Myonnesos), the Seljuk and Ottoman settlements (Karaköse, Sığacık Castle, Seferihisar), Historical Turkish baths “Hamam” in Turkish (Büyükhamam, Küçükhamam, Ulamışhamam, Düzcemhamam, SığacıkKaleiçiHamam), Mosque and madrasahs (Hereke Mosque, KasımÇelebi Madrasah and Social Complex, Ulamış Mosque, Güdük Minaret Mosque, Hidrlik Mosque, Turabiye Mosque, Ulu(Great) Mosque, Sığacık Mosque), Water aqueduct (seven girls aqueduct) Tumuli (GüneşliKent tumulus, Hidrlik Tumuli)</td>
<td>Sıyırma dessert, Tarhana Yuvalaça Ekmekdolması, Mandarin dessert EnginarDolması Samsades dessert Nohutlu Mantı Traditional Armola</td>
<td>Agricultural products and village bazaar (Armola goat cheese, satsuma mandarin, Alfons type of grape, house wine, olive oil</td>
<td>Women’s Cooperative Seferipazar.com Seed bank project Sustainable Fishery Project (AB) Vegetable gardens at schools Sığacık Landscape Project (IZKA - Izmir Development Agent) Atatürk Avenue Improvement Study Children-Friendly Seferihisar Project (UNICEF) Ecological Branding in Tourism (IZKA) Blue Flag Projects Project of Monumental Olive Trees Project of Home for Street Animals Children’s Municipality Project Nature School Project Dutlaraltı Square Project Young Bank Project Project of Women’s Labor Centers Beach soccer field project Teos wetland dune support project Project of Fairytale Centers Project of treatment plant establishment Project of wise tree olive oil production Tangerine jam – canned artichoke project (IZKA) Street luminaries with solar energy Carbon emission estimation Compost facility Construction of solar energy plant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tourism, Leisure and Global Change, volume 5, p. 262

Papers from The 11th Tourism Outlook Conference
2-5 October 2018, Eskişehir, Turkey
Copyright: CC: NC-BY-ND-SA
Yörük Ali Efe Museum, Beyler Tower, Donduran Castle, AlhanHamam, Aşağı Dip Natura Park, Çamlık Recreation Area, historic windmill

EkmekDolması YenipazarPidesi Et Lelegisi Hurma(Yuvarlama) KarnabaharMüeveri, Keşkek YavruKavurmusı Traditional KaraçakalYörüldileri Culture and Promotion Festival Traditional Camel Wrestling Cycling Festival Spring Festival

Organic bazaars, bee culture, ginnery, olive oil fabric, Vegetable-fruit growing (cotton, corn, wheat, olives), production of traditional folk arts such as folk dolls, iğneoyası Ottoman telkirma, mountaineering, trekking, paragliding, bird watching

Municipality Energy Saving Project by using alternative energy resources (renewable resources, green hydrogen, mini-hydroelectric energy plant) and producing renewable resources and heat from biomasses. Solar furnace project Natural Products Market Project “sospesopiantare” project “Women’s Environment Culture and Operation Cooperative Seed trade project “Student Gardens” project Aşağı Dip Lake Natural Orthosis Cultural Center “Aşağı Dip Lake Natural Park” project preparations are ongoing

Hoyran Lake, Ayini Cave, Çınarlıs Devlethan Mosque, Psidia Ancient City, House of Tiraşhare, House of Keçe, Leather Industry Open Air Museum, Mustafa Bilgin Art House, Traditional Dining House, Yalvaç Museum, rock toms, Ay Tanrısı Men sanctuary, Ottoman Hamam, Kacakoçak hill, Asmakayalar Cave, Yenesu Cave, Koyköy, Cehennem Waterfall, GaziSüleymanPaşa Mosque (LittelAyasofya), Serbetdar Hasan bey Mosque, Vize Castle and rampart, Ancient theater, FerhatBeyHamam and fountain, Asmakayalar monastery

Linden honey Vize cheese, oğlakçevirme, kiremittemantarlialab alik, stinging nettle soup Thrace gastronomy festival

Vegetable-fruit growing (Wheat, sunflower, sugar beet, corn, legumes, onion), bee culture, fishery, Diving, kite surf, paragliding tourism

Wind plant project for clean energy production Street Development Project in collaboration with Thrace Development Agency Cultural Heredity for Cross-Border Harmony and Prospect Project of Improvement of Vize Country Waste Management Infrastructure Bicycle” Project To borderless Equality – Youth Camp Project Improvement of Haliçi Region by accomplishing “Local Project” of Vize’s Attraction Center Cross-Border Youth Cultural Center

Hamsiliplav, melocankavurması, jonycake, ret beet soup and sarma, sakaracarayaganasi, Galdırıkavurması, pickle

Fishery, Diving, kite surf, paragliding tourism Vegetable-fruit growing (hazelnut, kiwi, strawberry)

Establishment of the Sewage Treatment Facility Ivy geranium distribution to all porches located at seaside and poles located at central refuge Building approximately 10 km of bicycle track from OrduKumbaşı District till Perşembekaleya District Building birdwatching places at Hoynat Island bird heaven and rearrangement of Koçboyunuzu (Kral) path as a hiking trail in collaboration with the Nature Association Street Development Project and Perşembe City Square Project Organic market

Papers from The 11th Tourism Outlook Conference 2-5 October 2018, Eskişehir, Turkey Copyright: CC: NC-BY-ND-SA
**EĞİRDİR**

- Madrasah
- Dündaybey
- Prostanna Ancient City
- Bedre village
- Kovada Lake Green Island
- Eğirdir Caravanserai
- Eğirdir castle
- Eğirdir lake
- İnçer Mosque
- Engüzel castle
- Sapanca (Eşkisor) castle
- Öşk (peribacaları)
- Çağlayan Cave
- Yedigöller
- Tortum waterfall
- Platform bridge
- Yavuzköy viewing platform

** половини**

- Haşuta, kaysefuzurfiyet, sinor, kuymak, gendima, şilay, pekmez, cheese erte ime, iron dessert, pickles
- Sahara Culture and Art Festival
- ŞavşatYavuzköy Winter festivals
- ŞavşatVeliköy snow wrestling festival
- MeydancıkSateve festival
- KarüstüKarakucak wrestling festival
- Marioba festival
- Çavdarlı village
- Saparkule festival

**ŞAVŞAT**

- Tandır bread
- DAP-Young-Festival,
- Traditional Karakuçak Wrestling
- Bird Watch Festival
- East Anatolian Youth Festival

**UZUNDERE**

- A kitchen where apple is used in different dishes
- Triathlon races
- Bridge tournaments,
- Classical Music Festival, Moral Festival Motorcycle and Bicycle Festivals
- Classical Music Festival Optimist
- Races for Children

**CATTLE RAISING**

- Sablefish kebab, eggplant tomato, onion, fig kebab, çayırtaklı kebab, dolma eziği, plum tava, mukasırı pilav, sarguruma tatlıs, semsek, cheese halva
- Cattle-raising, sheep and goat breeding viniculture, Olive cultivation, Peanut breeding, cereal planting, Boating tourism

**ORGANIC MARKET**

- Organic market
- Halfeti city park
- District sports fields
- Halfeti Pier and Marina project
- Project of electric production from garbage

**EVENTS**

- Fruit Food Festival
- Fragrance Festival
- Black Rose Festival
- Haşuta, kaysefuzuriyeyet, sinor, kuymak, gendima, şilay, pekmez, cheese erte ime, iron dessert, pickles
- Sahara Culture and Art Festival
- ŞavşatYavuzköy Winter festivals
- ŞavşatVeliköy snow wrestling festival
- MeydancıkSateve festival
- KarrüstüKarakucak wrestling festival
- Marioba festival
- Çavdarlı village
- Saparkule festival

**PROJECTS**

- Uzundere Boutique Hotel and Welcoming Center Project
- Project of Supporting Yıkıklar Natural Environment Protection and Process of Joining of Çoruh Valley to Eurovelo European Bicycle Network
- Project of European Tourism Indicators of Sustainable Management (ETIS) at Destination Uzundere tourism master plan 2023

**PAPERS**

- Papers from The 11th Tourism Outlook Conference
- 2-5 October 2018, Eskişehir, Turkey
- Copyright: CC: NC-BY-ND-SA
As seen in Table 4, the activities performed by local administrations in slow cities that joined the Cittaslow Charter during and after the Cittaslow membership process are assessed according to the tools determined by UNESCO in the historical city landscape approach.
Table 4: Comparison of slow cities according to the tools determined by UNESCO in the historical city landscape approach.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The tools determined by UNESCO</th>
<th>+ SEFERİHİSAR + TARI AĞDIN + GÖKÇEADA + ARYAKA + YENİPAZAR + YALVAŞ + VİZE + PERŞEMBE + HALİRTİ + ŞAVŞAT + UZUNDERE + EĞİRİR + GÖYÜK + GERZE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accessible, multiplatform urban planning vision process</td>
<td>+ - + - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public forums about aspects of the urban future</td>
<td>+ - + - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web based local heritage games</td>
<td>+ - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban heritage issues web exchange blogs, chat rooms</td>
<td>+ - + + - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning charrettes with open dialogue</td>
<td>+ + - + + + + + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation projects, oral interviews, videos</td>
<td>+ - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volunteer efforts to sustain local historic places</td>
<td>+ - + - - - - + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community heritage stewardship skill development, workshops, projects</td>
<td>+ - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holistic planning process that incorporates urban heritage &amp; values</td>
<td>+ + - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation of tangible &amp; intangible community heritage</td>
<td>+ - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban viewscape mapping for building envelope, height, location</td>
<td>+ + + + + + - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning for conservation of natural &amp; cultural resources</td>
<td>+ + + + + + - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Targeted urban preservation, management, tourism plans</td>
<td>+ + - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green infrastructure knowledge applied with heritage considered</td>
<td>+ - + + + + + + - - - - + - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plans incorporating heritage values to address streets, public facilities, storm-water, parks, etc.</td>
<td>+ + + + + + - - - - - + - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning ordinance underpinned by urban heritage database</td>
<td>+ - - - - + + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservation development plan</td>
<td>+ + + + + + - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional, customary systems, indigenous peoples</td>
<td>+ + + + + + + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislated climate change targets</td>
<td>- - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tree protection ordinance</td>
<td>- - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Infrastructure, Renewable Energy Codes</td>
<td>+ + - + + - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-purpose overlay districts, for economy, heritage, aesthetics, conservation</td>
<td>+ + - + - - - + - + - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislation specifically addressing urban heritage stewardship/management</td>
<td>+ + - - + + + + + + - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban viewscape controls</td>
<td>+ - - - + + + + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Public Partnership targeted funding for Urban Heritage</td>
<td>+ + - - - - + + + + - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Capital Improvements</td>
<td>+ - - - + + + + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ongoing Public Maintenance Staffing &amp; Budgets</td>
<td>+ + + - - - - + - + - + - + -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Building &amp; Property Maintenance</td>
<td>+ - - - - - - - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revolving Loan Fund addressing Historic Structures</td>
<td>+ + - + + + + - - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-Term Lease of Heritage Properties</td>
<td>+ - - - - - - + - - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal facilities in the protection actions</td>
<td>+ + - - - - + - + - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Slow Cities in Turkey
Conclusions

Studies conducted at public spaces by local administrations in slow cities of Turkey can have multiple aspects encompassing various headings in the membership criteria. However, landscape design in public spaces may be assessed within more definitive limits in the framework of the target of the easy and convenient use of public spaces by city dwellers and achieving sustainable local progress and attaining good living quality. In this context, as a result of a general assessment based on the impressions obtained in field studies, the organizations of public spaces in slow cities in Turkey can be grouped in the lights of the membership criteria under the headings of, pedestrianizing /vehicle-free road, street improvement/development, square landscape design, park and sports field organization, providing areas for local producers/producer markets, cultural centers/city museum, alternative transportation roads (bicycle tracks, etc.), restored/transformed structures as open to public, studies conducted for the involvement of women and youngsters in public spaces, access of disabled people to public spaces, establishment of public communication areas through internet/ social media use, blue flag beaches for counties located by seaside (Yavuzcêhre&Donat, 2017).

Considering the general assessment in addition to the city assessment, despite it is indicated that there are specific arrangements in any slow city, it is common knowledge that these arrangements occur in considerably different numbers and characteristics in slow cities. It is seen that relatively specific studies in locations have been conducted excluding Seferihisar in the framework of slow city criteria for improving sustainable local development and life quality.

Considering slow cities in the context of historical city landscape approach, it is seen that nearly all planning tools have been put into practice in Seferihisar slow city but, only a small part of them has been adopted in Gerze slow city. Considering the distribution of HLC toolkits in slow cities, knowledge and planning tools have been applied yet regulatory tools have not been applied adequately. This case can be explained by deficiencies in national protection policies or more substantial effect of defects in local scale. Among the tools proposed in the development of Historical Urban Landscape (HUL), while the applications made in Seferihisar and Gökçeada Cittaslow under the scope of Civic Engagement Tools stand out, it has been determined that the studies conducted in Gerze are generally insufficient. This situation is thought to be related to the year of obtaining the status of a Cittaslow.

It is seen that especially the conservation practices concentrated in slow cities of Seferihisar, Gökçeada, Yenipazar, Uzungöl, Perşembe and Göynük but Halfeti is behind. The lack of development plans for protection in the slow city of Halfeti is an important deficiency in planning studies aimed at preserving deficiencies in tourism master plans and infrastructure plans.

Regulatory systems tool within the frame of global climate change in all slow cities due to the risk analysis (erosion, carrying capacity, etc.) was not done and in this context, the protection regulations were not required to determine the legal regulations were determined. Within the scope of the green infrastructure system in slow cities, only the applications to benefit from solar energy have been determined.
In the context of financial tools, it is determined that the necessary budgets for conservation practices are supported by local administrations through protection implementation and audit offices, development agencies, sponsorship and donation campaigns. However, it is known that non-governmental organizations, in general, are not actively involved in this process.

Generally, it is well known that having the title of Cittaslow is not a conclusion but a process. It is seen that the success of applications to be performed in the context of Cittaslow criteria and historical city landscape approach depends on achieving sustainability of activities and applications that are to be conducted by local administrations as the most critical actor of the application and management of the process. The process progresses uninterruptedly and based on the means of the local administration in slow cities, where the management and administration staff have not been changed by elections, however, this process has been interrupted in cities, whose administrators have been changed. This situation can be clarified by adopting Cittaslow cognizance by public and awareness improvement (Özmen et al., 2006).

References


**Biographical Notes**

Aysun Tuna is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University, Battalgazi, Malatya, Türkiye where she teaches courses on the historical landscape and landscape design and application techniques. Her research focuses on the sustainable historical urban landscape.

Hulisi Binbasioglu is an Assistant Professor of the School of Kale Tourism and Hotel Management at Malatya Turgut Özal University in Turkey. He received his BSc in Tourism and Hotel Management at Anadolu University, Eskisehir, and MSc and PhD in Marketing from Inonu University, Malatya. His teaching and researches related to tourism, cultural heritage, mobile technology and social media.

Bilge Hatun Ay is a graduate student in the Department of Landscape Architecture, İnönü University, Battalgazi, Malatya.