An Integrated Research Review of Ethics Articles in Hospitality Journals 1990 to 2000

Christine Jaszay, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Director of the Marion W. Isbell
Endowment for Hospitality Ethics

Northern Arizona University
May 20, 2001

Purpose

The purpose of this paper is to review and assess the hospitality literature on ethics to result in a synthesis of the material. At the onset, it was assumed that there were many articles on the topic of ethics in the various hospitality journals over the past ten years. The researcher was interested in determining a summary view, which could serve as a basis for future applied research and practical application of the results.

Method

The Lodging, Restaurant, and Tourism Index out of Purdue University was used as the only source of hospitality journals. Articles were found under the key word heading of "Business Ethics'" and were collected and read from the years 1990 through 2000. Thirty-three hospitality journals contained a total of 117 articles on ethics over the ten-year time period. Once all the articles were read and analyzed, the qualitative methodology of allowing the topic areas to emerge from the data was utilized, and nine topic areas were delineated. The topic areas were rearranged in an order that represented a sequential flow of the topics. Relationships between topic areas and journal titles and publication dates were looked at for evidence of obvious trends and/or interest continuity.

The articles in each topic area were rearranged until a reasonable order and outline emerged. The researcher was not looking for any particular results or findings, satisfied with simply accepting and organizing the writings of others with the expectation that conclusions could eventually be drawn from the processing and synthesizing of the materials.

Description of the Data

Figure 1 lists the topic areas and the total number of articles for each topic area. Figure 2 provides a visual overview of the total number of articles written in each journal, their publishing dates, and topics. Figure 3 shows the total number of hospitality journal articles on ethics each year for the ten-year period.

Three of the four journals with the most articles on ethics were Successful Meetings, Meeting News, and Meetings & Conventions. The ethical behavior of meeting planners and the inherent ethical dilemmas they face are prime concerns of the meeting planning industry with 32 of 117 articles (27%) devoted to ethics in meeting planning. Twenty-nine of the 32 articles fell in the first three topic areas which have to do with identifying unethical behavior and taking individual personal action to make ethical decisions.

While more ethics articles appeared in the hospitality journals between 1990 and 1994 than from 1994 to 2000, the differences were small, there weren't enough articles, and the time period wasn't long enough to draw valid conclusions (see Figure 3). Figure 2 is of interest in terms of who did what when, but trends or conclusions are not readily apparent.

Unlike the articles on ethics in hotels or restaurants, the articles on tourism ethics did not fit in any of the other content areas (see Figure 1). The tourism articles were like the tree in "hammer, saw, screwdriver, tree" -- important but not directly related.

Review of the Topics

Each of the nine topic areas were thoroughly reviewed so that anyone wishing to know what has gone on in the hospitality journals in terms of ethics in the last ten years could read this one article in lieu of all 117 articles.

Unethical Actions (Topic 1)

Twenty-seven of the 117 articles (23%) fell in the "Unethical Actions" category. Of the 27 articles in Topic One, 17 (63%) were from the journals of the meetings industry (Successful Meetings, Meetings & Conventions, and Meeting News). Planning the meetings and conventions which contributed an estimated $56 billion to the U.S. economy in 1991 is extremely time consuming, expensive, and stressful (Newman, 1992).

In the early 1990's fam trip abuse (complimentary on-site visits to properties by planners) was a major issue (Carr, 1992; Ligos, 1997). The International Association of Convention & Visitor Bureaus took steps to identify bogus planners and report their activities to the IRS, state attorney generals, and the U.S. Postal Service in order to protect the reputations of legitimate planners and the planning industry (Carr, 1992).

Many of the expenses for meetings, such as shuttle services, audio-visual, entertainment, receptions, convention center charges, etc. are not covered by registration fees. For the past 30 years hotels have been willing to rebate a few dollars from the negotiated room rates back to the planners to cover expenses (McNulty, 1990). The planning industry has been debating the issue of whether attendees should be notified of the rebate. Industry attorneys, however, find it unethical and potentially illegal to not disclose rebate agreements to attendees (Ligos, 1997). Rebates from the hotels sometimes go to individuals rather than to pay for meeting expenses, and kickbacks given to third parties bringing business can be criminal (Ligos, 1998).

Covert commissions, where planners demand secret payments for booking with a property, can result in commercial bribery suits. Most planners say they do not accept or ask for covert commissions (Ligos, 1997). While there are recommendations, there are no industry-wide guidelines to govern rebates and third party commissions, and planners' decisions are left to their own discretion (Ligos, 1998).

All three meeting planning journals had articles describing questionable hotel tactics. Some planners thought gifts with the hotel's logo were acceptable but found expensive or personal gifts unacceptable (O'Brien, 1990). Free rooms, limo service, and entertainment are among the incentives hotels have used to encourage planners to book meetings at their properties. The line between acceptable and unacceptable gifts is not clear and makes for difficult ethical decisions (O'Brien, 1990).

Some hotels were reported tacking on surcharges if planners wanted to use their own vendors. Hotel recommended vendors may be very good, however, it was suggested that the issue of surcharges should be openly discussed during negotiations rather than be an after-the-fact surprise for planners (Weiland, 1991). Often the surcharges were dropped if planners balked at paying them (Weiland, 1991). Some hotels have exclusive agreements with preferred vendors. Quality control can be improved, however services may be more expensive. Planners need to have an awareness of possible profit motives in the relationships between hotels and preferred vendors and "shop-around" (Crystal, 1993).

Hyatt and Marriott offer points for booking meetings. The points can be redeemed for free rooms, vacations, and/or frequent flyer miles (Jensen, 1994). Meeting Professionals International and The Society for Government Meeting Planners prohibit accepting points and/or gifts. The incentive programs are, however, extremely successful (Jensen, 1994).

The American Medical Association, the Pharmaceutical Manufacturers Association, and the Food and Drug Administration issued ethical guidelines concerning sponsorship of medical meetings. Formally pharmaceutical companies planned lavish meetings and presented continuing medical-education courses for physicians (McNulty, 1991). Drug companies were to have no role in creating or influencing scientific exchange (McNulty, 1991). Meeting planners, hired by drug companies, no longer considered "third party" planners by the FDA, found themselves frozen out of the business.

The meeting planning industry has been very open about its ethical shortcomings. Restaurants and hotels have indicated some ethical problems also. Huxley's and T.G.I Friday's in New York were cited for charging tourists higher prices than regular customers (Alva, 1992). Deceptive advertising with the use of contrived restaurant ratings given to member restaurants came to the attention of the Center for Science in the Public Interest (Nichols, 1995).

Questionable ethical practices seem to take place on all sides. Clients have been known to share meeting planner proposals with lower bidders and implement the original planners' ideas (Grimaldi, 1996). The Illinois Department of Public Aid asked its employees to take the amenities from the hotels they stayed in on business trips, to give to the homeless (Gillette, 1990). Liquor liability became an issue for meeting planners when meeting attendees were involved in accidents and the companies holding the meetings were held liable (Butler, 1991).

Between 25 and 50% of all trade show organizers and managers have provided inaccurate attendance figures to exhibitors. Trade show organizers were given "lukewarm" encouragement by the Society of Independent Show Organizers to audit attendance (Conlin, 1992). The treatment of founders of successful hospitality corporations such as Marie Callender's, Pizza Hut, Popeyes, and Carl Karcher Enterprises, when they were voted or sold out, was described as "disgraceful" (Bernstein, 1994).

Ethical misbehavior resulted in a tax evasion conviction for Victor Posner whose holding company, DWG Corp., owned Arby's (Brooks, 1992). Kathleen Tompkins was a meeting planner for Salomon Brothers until she admitted stealing $1 million from them by submitting false invoices for gifts never given out at corporate functions (Ghitelman, 1994). British Businessman Richard Branson accused American businessman Guy Snowden of trying to bribe him, and Snowden sued for libel (Hiday, 1996). The San Diego County Grand Jury accused and exonerated Mayor Susan Golding of misconduct for allegedly appropriating $4 million toward the San Diego Convention and Visitors Bureau's marketing program in exchange for the San Diego County Hotel-Motel Association's support of a new ballpark and downtown redevelopment project (Seal, 1999).

Hospitality managers and employees are at risk when someone in the organization "blows the whistle" and reports wrongdoing. Whistle blowers are often wrongfully discharged, but may not be successful in court if they try to sue for their jobs (Special report, 1990). The Professional Conduct Committee of Meeting Planners International conduct investigations of ethical breaches involving their members with the hope of avoiding law suits and/or criminal charges. Being accused of unethical behavior can ruin reputations, so Meeting Planners International strongly encourages that all investigations

be conducted confidentially (Conlin, 1992).Books such as The Meeting Planner's Legal Handbook are useful guides to the legal and ethical issues meeting planners face (Ligos, 1996). When trying to make good decisions W. P. Fisher writes, "the best ethical posture for any organization or person is unswerving commitment to the truth, to progress, to service to others, and to the integrity of one's own existence (Fisher, 1993).

Sixteen articles spread evenly over the past decade indicate an interest in identifying the levels of ethical awareness in the various segments of the hospitality industry. The meeting industry, with 6 of the 16 articles, addressed ethics at local and national conferences regularly. The meeting industry may be more concerned with ethical issues because of outside perceptions as a "freebie-laden industry of party throwers and party goers" (Conlin, 1992).

A few of the professional meeting planner organizations adopted codes of ethics and adherence programs to improve the image of the industry, and a 1992 survey showed that some previously accepted business practices had become unacceptable (Conlin, 1992). On-going ethical instruction in the industry journals and conferences exposed professionals to appropriate ethical decisions through the use of scenarios (Your ethics, 1993; Sturken, 1007)).

The results of a poll of 104 members of Meeting Professionals International's Georgia Chapter showed a disparity between what planners say they do and what they actually do. It was suggested that the members polled were professionals, and the disparity was caused by the actions of non-member, part-time planners (Edelstein, 1994).

Organizations are realizing that values may have to come from the organizations rather than from the individuals in the organizations and are beginning to have ethics training (Sturken, 1997). Sixty-three percent of the members attending the Society of Incentive & Travel Executives International Conference in 1999 said they had to deal with ethical situations at least once a month and felt their ethics compromised regularly (Meyers, 1999). Decisions often come down to how much the planner or company wants the business (Meyers, 1999).

Results of 250 planners and industry suppliers polled at the Meeting Professionals International World Education Congress indicated lying, cheating, and stealing were not uncommon practices in the industry (Ligos, 1999). As unethical actions become the norm, the reputation of the planning industry will be further tarnished (Ligos, 1999).

Hospitality financial managers were asked if they agreed with the actions of the controller in 16 hypothetical scenarios in a survey of 630 members of the International Association of Hospitality Accountants (Schmidgall & Damitio, 1991). Four hundred lodging managers responded to 15 similar scenarios in a survey by the same researcher (Schmidgall, 1992). Club managers were also surveyed.

Controllers, lodging managers, and club managers responses were compared in a fourth similar study with just seven scenarios. The three groups were found to be in overall agreement with club managers, however, disagreeing more often with the hypothetical club manager (Damitio & Schmidgall, 1993). Readers of Lodging were given the opportunity to take the survey for the purpose of measuring themselves against the lodging managers' responses from the original survey (Schmidgall, 1991). Results of graduating seniors in a university hospitality program, taking the same survey, were found to parellel those of lodging managers (Casado, Miller, & Vallen, 1994).   The

hypothetical manager in each of the scenarios for each of the three groups was not, however, acting in defined ethical or unethical ways. Rather, managers, students, and readers were simply comparing their behavior to that of other managers instead of with an ethical standard.

Three hundred forty nine students from six university hospitality programs responded to a survey requesting their perceptions of the most pressing ethical issues facing the hospitality industry. Discrimination and employment relationships were identified as problematic and perhaps related to high turnover rates. Air/water pollution was ranked as the most serious issue (Enghagen & Hott, 1992). It was noted in later research that examples and wording can bias respondants' answers. In a replication of the above study, with only an example changed, the perception of pollution as an ethical issue went from 34.4% to 7.7% Weaver, Choi, & Kaufman, 1997).

Forty-two hotel human resource directors in 15 different states were interviewed to identify ethical issues. Lack of work ethic followed by drug use, theft, incivility, and lying were identified as critical (Stevens, 1999). Thirty human resource directors in 11 states were interviewed to determine real-life ethical scenarios (in response to the Schmidgall hypothetical scenarios). A survey was created and 84 human resource directors and 8 1 university hospitality students responded as to whether the action in each scenario was ethical or unethical (Stevens & Fleckenstein, 1999). There was a clear difference between the responses of human resource directors and students indicating a continuing need for communication of ethical standards to new hires and all employees (Stevens & Fleckenstein, 1999).

Defining a code of conduct (ethics code) can help employees and managers recognize acceptable behavior. Managers are encouraged to discuss ethics with employees to positively build the culture of the organization and increase affiliation (Stevens, 1999). A survey of foodservice directors, employees, and students found that managers, older employees, and those with more experience had higher ethical scores (Ghiselli, 1999). Students scored 44% lower than foodservice directors and university hospitality programs are encouraged to teach ethics to better prepare future foodservice directors (Ghiselli, 1999).

How to do the Right Thing (Topic 3)

Six of the 12 articles (50 %) in this topic area are from the meeting industry journals, while four articles are from the foodservice industry, one from hotels, and one from marketing. Ethics are not necessarily laws. Ethics may be defined as "standards of civility, duty and professionalism that cause decisions to be made and actions to be taken that are in the best individual, organizational and public interest" (Fisher's Law, 1992). Some companies have created "corporate ethics officers" to help managers confront difficult questions without clear cut answers (Griffin, 1993). In the absence of ethics officers and/or ethics codes managers are urged to periodically review their decisions and ask whether they would like to see their actions reported in the press or known by their clients or the public (Adams, 1996). People prefer doing business with organizations and people they trust (McCarthy, 1996). Breaking contracts or promises, giving or taking kickbacks, unfair hotel pricing policies all undermine trust and can decrease profits (McCarthy, 1996).

Foodservice suppliers often send gifts at Christmas. The intent of expensive gifts

is to influence foodservice directors' purchasing decisions. Expensive gifts (over $5) should be returned to suppliers with notes explaining no-gift policies (Bloch, 1992) or in advance of any gifts, gift policy statement letters could be sent to suppliers to avoid embarrassment (Patterson, 1992). When gifts or perks become bribes may be a function of disclosure, however in the meeting planning industry, it is ultimately up to individual planners to decide what is right to accept (Lenhart, 1998). Meeting planner professional journals encourage planners to make ethical decisions by exposing readers to scenarios (Eisenstodt, 1992a) with ethical solutions (Eisenstodt, 1992b).

Hotel pricing strategies could be construed as unfair by customers and the public. Consistent rates would enhance the reputation of the industry and result in higher profits (McCarthy, 1994). It has been suggested that the hospitality industry needs to move from transactions to relationships, that is, from control to trust. Shared ethical convictions motivating organizations benefits employees, customers, and the bottom line (Feltenstein, 1999). Because dishonesty is a moral failure and bad for business, hospitality professionals must make personal commitments to be honest, look at their behavior, and develop integrity (McDonald, 1996).

Company Values (Topic 4)

Six articles were about company values. The level of the articles in this topic area rose from "this is what we do wrong and what we ought to do" to attempting to understand how underlying values of organizations affect the behaviors of managers and employees. The first three topic areas were heavily meeting planner generated. Perhaps it is the nature of the meeting planner industry, where planners are operating somewhat independently from the organizations, that accounts for the emphasis on behavior. That many of the articles in the first three topics were written by industry people rather than academics may also account for the orientation.

Problems in organizations may actually be symptoms of inconsistency between values (what they say they believe) and norms (what they do). Employee turnover is a result of incompatible values and can be reduced when employees correctly perceive that the norms of the operation protect their own personal values (Goll, 1990). Companies must clarify their own values in order to hire people with consistent values, because shared values results in more team work and long-term success (Lefever & Reich, 1991).

Communication is a key to good management. Understanding the values of organizations and employees is necessary for good communication. Employees must be selected who fit the organization in terms of skills and abilities but also in terms of values and attitudes for the match to be successful in the long-term (McCleary & Vosburgh, 1990). A survey given to foodservice managers and hospitality students showed a significant difference between the two groups in 16 out of 36 values. Communication between existing managers and young new hires may be problematic without shared values, and organizations may need a mechanism for fostering understanding (McCleary & Vosburgh, 1990).

Companies can communicate their values to divers workforces by encouraging discussions, asking questions, rewarding positive behavior, and modeling exemplary behaviors (Kelley, 1997). To be successful, companies must realize that the values they communicate affect the bottom line. Profit can only be achieved, in the long-run, by balancing values with numbers (Costello, 1994).

One hundred five management-level members of the Washington State Lodging Association tended to hold traditional values which were not philosophically highly developed. Hospitality students had similar results when given the same survey instrument. The managers were more inclined to respect and prefer laws when making difficult ethical decisions, and often trampled their own values in business when no laws applied (Whitney, 1990). There are examples, however, of managers who stood-up for their values under fire and are accorded the title of "true professional" (Whitney, 1990).

<u>Ethics and Leadership (Topic 5)</u>

Nine articles concerned the relationship between ethics and leadership. Business and personal decisions need to be ethical because they affect guests, employees, suppliers, friends, and families (Peceri, 1997). Ethical people are concerned for others and live their lives according to the highest level of human principles (Fisher, 1998). Creating ethical workplaces requires dealing with the differences in standards within the workforce (Kapoor, 1991). The shared values of the past, which helped people to make ethical decisions, are not as universal today. Leaders, through trust, must develop common value systems in the workplace (Bethel, 1999).

Transformational leadership, which focuses on the future and influencing changes in attitudes and building organizational commitment, was shown to be "most effective" in a study of leadership in a large hotel management company (Tracey & Hinkin, 1994). Transformational leaders manage the continual change of today's business environment through adaptation rather than control, and they display strong values and pay attention to the consequences of their decisions (Tracey & Hinkin, 1994).

Understanding the type of ethical work-climate in organizations can help them to understand how management and employees react to various ethical situations. A study was conducted to categorize lodging general managers according to their dominant leadership styles and the ethical work-climates of their properties (Upchurch & Ruhland, 1995). Once the underlying decision making system is identified, management and employees can be trained in ethical theory to be able to handle ethical situations more efficiently (Upchurch & Ruhland, 1995).

Two hundred twenty foodservice managers responded to two questionnaires designed to identify vexing situations in foodservice management and to rate their responses to the situations (Ghiselli & Ismail, 1999). Seventy-five percent of the foodservice managers had written codes of ethics in their operations. The research suggested that operations with written ethical codes for foodservice managers to follow, held ethics in higher regard (Ghiselli & Ismail, 1999).

Employees have differing ethical beliefs, so management should identify situations that could pose ethical dilemmas for their employees in order to provide clear rules for employees to follow. Younger employees need particular attention in terms of their higher tolerance for unethical behaviors, and ethical training is strongly recommended for all employees (Wong, 1998).

The declining ethics of workers have been lamented, however, a participant/observer study of garde manger cooks in a large hotel described the workers as "industrious, disciplined, hard working, and proud members of the workforce" being undermined by poor management (Walczak, 1997).

<u>Codes of Ethics, the Need for and How to Develop Them (Topic 6)</u>

Nineteen articles in three related topics were combined for Topic 6. Making ethical decisions requires the ability to recognize ethical issues and analyze them in terms of appropriate ethical principles (Wolfe, 1992). People's ethical values are not always the same, so organizations must establish common values that everyone can be comfortable with (Schaefer, 1991). A written code of shared values can serve as a guideline for dealing with ethical dilemmas (Lerman, 1990).

The goal of any ethics code is to, of course, create an environment conducive to ethical behavior, because it is through ethical behavior that guests' needs will be met or exceeded, and the organization will profit (Hogan, 1992). When hospitality organizations are facing difficult financial times, cutbacks are often considered. However, ethical behavior and the training programs to maintain ethical behavior must continue to be a priority for organizations to survive troubled times (Hogan, 1992).

Organizations need shared value systems in order to be able to maintain consistency within their organizations. As organizations globalize, their internal value systems may or may not be consistent with those of organizations of other cultures, which can undermine ethical behavior. A global ethic may be necessary for international hospitality companies (Guest editorial, 1996).

Management styles that are less self-centered and more pro-social are linked to the ethical areas of responsibility, quality, and employee welfare and have been shown to decrease costs (Fox, 2000). Pro-social management requires the capacity for higher level moral judgment. In some developing countries, it may be necessary to introduce managerial leadership training programs to develop the capacity for higher level moral reasoning (Fox, 2000).

The ethical standards of organizations, whether they be written or unwritten, serve as frameworks for employees' behavior. Organizations prefer having trustworthy employees – ethical employees, and because traditional values have become less prevalent, written codes of ethics may be necessary (Beasley, 1995) An ethics code must match the beliefs of the organization, and all levels of the organization must be committed to its success.

To successfully implement an ethics code it is necessary to introduce it and foster an awareness of ethical situations with the entire staff. Management and workers can be taught the four step method of problem solving by (1) identifying the ethical dilemma in a case study, (2) identifying the stakeholders, (3) determining possible solutions, and (4) implementing the solution (Alderson, 1994). Case studies and lectures can help employees to match appropriate decisions and behaviors to various situations (Axline, 1991).

Perceptions of unfairness, favoritism, and inconsistency in employee selection, supervision, promotion and performance may be the result of miscommunication. For ethical awareness programs to be successful, communication must be open and honest (Axline, 199 1), and the standards must be communicated in clear language understood by all (Tapoor, 1992).

The National Round Table on the Environment and the Economy along with the Canadian tourism industry developed a code of ethics designed to guide the industry to sustainable tourism development (D' Amore, 1993). Some Atlanta restaurateurs in 1993 urged all Atlanta restaurants to take a "hospitality pledge" to do business ethically during the upcoming Olympics (Hayes, 1993). The International Franchise Association, on the

other hand, developed a code of ethics in response to federal and state scrutiny of the industry, thinking self-regulation would be preferable to government regulation (Allen, 1992). Professional organizations will often have codes of ethics for their memberships to enhance the reputation of the particular industry and to reduce outside regulation (Weinstein, 1993). The International Association for Exposition Management, however, concluded that ethics were up to individuals to decide for themselves and not the business of professional organizations (IAEM on ethics, 1999).

A universal Code of Ethics for the Foodservice Industry was developed as a result of analyzing the codes of ethics from five major foodservice organizations (Sawyer, 1990). Ethical Principles in Hospitality Management were offered as guides for decision making in the hospitality industry (Vallen & Miller, 1995). Codes of ethics have been criticized for being too generic and platitudinous, and without power to reward and punish, they are often ineffective (Malloy & Fennell, 1998).

Fewer ethics codes are found in the hotel industry than in corporate America. When hotel companies have ethics codes they are more likely to be used defensively to protect themselves from serious ethical errors rather than to encourage ethical behavior (Stevens, 1997). Hotels tend to stress the legal advantages of ethical behavior, that is, avoiding negative ramifications, rather than its inherent rightness (Stevens, 1997).

Forty tourism codes of ethics were analyzed in terms of their theoretical framework (Malloy & Fennell, 1998). Most of the codes were found to be deontological or based on duty to follow rules (the means are more important than the ends). Teleological ethical systems are based on the greatest good for the greatest number (the ends are more important than the means). A teleological approach to ethics requires identifying consequences of actions to all stakeholders as a means of decision making and would perhaps have more value for the hospitality industry (Malloy & Fennell, 1998).

Ethics for Hospitality Educators (Topic 7)

Four articles addressed the necessity of hospitality educators to behave ethically and recommended the establishment of an ethics code to provide guidelines to the relatively new discipline of hospitality education (Kwansa & Farrar, 1992). While most hospitality educators' ethical orientations fall within the norms of accepted academic behavior, there is a small but significant number who do not (Damitio, Whitney, & Schmidgall, 1992).

Falsifying data and research, negotiating grades, taking bribes, working under the influence of drugs or alcohol, and lying about accomplishments were deemed extremely unethical by the majority of hospitality faculty surveyed to identify ethical attitudes and behaviors (Damitiio, Whitney, & Schmidgall, 1992). Guidelines were proposed for the specific area of academic publishing to establish norms for hospitality researchers consistent with other academic disciplines (McCleary, 1994). Issues such as giving and taking credit for work, multiple submissions, and multiple articles from the same database were addressed in the proposed guidelines (McCleary, 1994).

A survey of hoteliers indicated their belief that hospitality educators were doing a poor job of teaching ethics (Kwansa & Fararr, 1992). If educators are to effectively teach ethics, perhaps they should have an agreed upon code of ethical behavior that will serve as a model of what they are attempting to teach.

An ethical code for hospitality educators would increase the acceptance of the discipline as a profession and, if enforced, increase the level of ethical behavior (Kwansa & Farrar, 1992). A precise code, as opposed to an abstract code, would provide a model of professional behavior and reinforce professional attitudes and judgments (Farrar & Kwansa, 1993).

<u>Teaching Ethics (Topic 8)</u>

How to teach ethics was the subject of 18 articles (15% of 117 articles). Developing an awareness and sensitivity to personal integrity should be one of the goals of all hospitality programs (Martin, 1998). It is generally agreed that it is necessary to teach ethics. One hundred fifty-nine students in a hospitality program strongly agreed that ethics should be taught in hospitality programs, and that it would positively affect their careers (Lundberg, 1994). Hospitality educators prepare students for careers in management and must address ethical and legal issues (March & Schmidgall, 1999).

It has been suggested that students and managers' personal codes of ethics may have been less than carefully considered and developed, while hospitality educators may not have the philosophical background to effectively teach ethics (Whitney, 1989). If, however, students are to obtain the cognitive skills and integrative abilities necessary for management, they will have to be able to recognize moral distinctions (Hegarty, 1990), and it is up to hospitality educators to prepare students to be successful (Whitney, 1989). A clear understanding of business ethics is essential for students' professional development (Christy & Coleman, 199 1).

Research has shown that college students may be guided into higher stages of moral reasoning through class discussions and "real-life" case studies (Martin, 1998; Vallen & Casado, 2000; Enghagen, 1991). Critical thinking skills may be developed by listening to students and challenging and coaching them rather than by telling them what and how to think (Costello, 1994).

Most educators agree that it is more effective to incorporate a thoroughly planned ethics component into each required course than to teach a separate ethics course (Enghagen, 1991). Age, experience, and gender were found to affect the level of moral development, with female students ahead of male students, and experienced managers ahead of all students (Freedman & Bartholomew, 1991). Values are best communicated through coaching and modeling (Stevens & Brownwell, 2000), so perhaps a four-year hospitality program with integrated ethics instruction utilizing case studies and taught by faculty whose values are consistent with the ethics curriculum, could be positively influential.

Hospitality graduates, who are attuned to their own values and those values match the values of their organizations, will be more comfortable discussing values and ethics with their own employees and more able to model appropriate ethical behavior at the work place. They will be better able to communicate organizations' ethical expectations to achieve desired ethical outcomes (Stevens & Brownwell, 2000).

Hospitality programs have incorporated industry work requirements for some time. Some programs, however, have added additional community service requirements to foster social responsibility, professional behavior, cultural sensitivity, and communication through working with divers populations for the good of the community (O'Halloran, 199 1; Stevens, 1999).

There are numerous methodologies available for ethical analysis. It is more difficult, however, to teach students to actually use the methodologies to make ethical decisions (Enghagen, 199 1). Instruction designed to encourage ethical behavior may only be evaluated by studying former students' behaviors over time. Attitudinal surveys will not be adequate for this purpose (Enghagen, 1991).

Most hospitality educators have a subject matter specialty. All educators, however, are responsible for teaching writing, oral communication, ethics and values (Lieux & Winquist, 199 1). While some hospitality educators are less than qualified to critique writing and/or teach ethics, it has been suggested that combining writing and ethics throughout the curriculum may be more effective than just assuming that exposure to ethical literate faculty will result in ethical literate students (Lieux & Winquist, 1991).

A strong ethical foundation may be more necessary for decision making in a people oriented industry such as hospitality. To be able to make good decisions in the future, students need to develop ethical awareness and understand ethical decision-making. They must be able to analyze ethical issues and apply the results (Khan & McCleary, 1996). Students can be familiarized with situations that are likely to occur and given the analysis tools to be able to understand and deal with the ramifications (Upchurch, 1998).

Research has shown that students tend to think in terms of outcomes of behaviors rather than behaviors themselves (Khan & McCleary, 1996). It has been suggested that teleological systems might have more application in the hospitality industry because managers can be taught to compare outcomes to the various stakeholders (customers, employees, the company, etc.) for each possible decision and select the decision that has the best outcomes (Khan & McCleary, 1996).

Several ethical decision making models have been proposed for teaching ethical decision making. Exercises designed to promote student reflection on their own behaviors in every day situations are available to enhance ethical awareness (Enghagen, 1993). Scenarios of ethical dilemmas facing many managers can be developed for students to practice defining and analyzing problems in terms of consequences, outcomes, and also their own personal outlooks (Upchurch, 1998).

Tourism Ethics (Topic 9)

Six articles make up Topic 9. Two other tourism articles were incorporated into Topic 6, but because tourism seems to be a unique industry (Walle, 1995), tourism articles became a category of themselves. The tourism industry is coming to agree with American ecologist Aldo Leopold that humanity is just one part of the whole (Lea, 1993; Hultsman, 1995; Malloy & Fennell, 1998). As a result, a change from the old tourism paradigm of profit driven megabusiness (Hegarty, 1992) to the expanded social consciousness requiring responsible tourism and tourism development where no harm comes to any of the stakeholders (Malloy & Fennell, 1998; Lea, 1993) is urgently needed to avoid ecocatastrophe (Hegarty, 1993).

Destruction of social structure and cultural values from tourism and development has been documented in parts of the Third World (Lea, 1993). The results of a survey, however, indicated that ecotourism operators were more ethically conscious than adventure, fishing or cruise/golf operators (Fennel1 & Malloy, 1999).

The ethical issues of the tourism industry are focused on sustainability which is an entirely different field of interest and will not be dealt with in this paper.

Conclusion

Ethical behavior results in more successful business for everyone – customers, workers, management, the community, and the company. The shared values of the past, however, are no longer vital, and organizations cannot leave it up to individuals to do the right thing, because often they don't know what the right thing is. Organizations may say one thing but have business practices or policies that don't agree or result in what they proclaim.

Laws are less confusing for most people and organizations. Since moral behavior is often not legislated, organizations need to have the ability to handle the ethical dilemmas they are constantly faced with. A new common ground must, therefore, be developed to enable managers and workers to make correct decisions when called for.

Considerable descriptive research in the form of surveys has been conducted to identify ethical beliefs and orientations of managers, employees, and students. Unethical behavior has been identified as well as the myriad of ethical situations inherent in the various parts of the hospitality industry. Research has shown the difference in ethical perceptions and beliefs between age groups, gender, and experience levels.

It is agreed that organizations must determine realistic ethical behavior guidelines that managers and employees can be taught and that can be adhered to by all. Several sources have recommended teleological systems of ethics as the most applicable to the hospitality industry. By considering all stakeholders we can determine the decision that results in the most good for the most people. Enough decisions and mistakes have been made over years to allow us to not have to analyze every situation over and over again. We can rely on "rules of thumb." Thus we have come to know that dishonesty, theft, lack of concern for others, and so forth have less than satisfactory results for all involved.

The hospitality industry has professionalized to the point where managers often come through university hospitality management degree programs. Research has shown that hospitality students' ethical belief systems are less developed than experienced managers'. Young adults may, however, be guided into higher levels of moral reasoning. It is the responsibility of university hospitality programs to teach ethics to enable potential managers to discern ethical dilemmas, analyze outcomes, and determine correct/ethical decisions.

Hospitality graduates trained in ethical analysis will enter existing organizations. It is up to organizations to identify their own ethical climates and to define preferred ethical climates. Managers and workers will have to be trained within the organization to accept a shared ethical belief system and to make decisions from that system.

Knowledge of ethical perceptions, beliefs, and orientations was initially necessary to determine needs and direction. We have now, however, established the need for ethical analysis instruction in hospitality programs and hospitality organizations. It is agreed that integrated case-studies analyzed in regard to best consequences is likely the best approach for teaching ethics in hospitality programs. Descriptive survey research has fulfilled its usefulness, and we must move into higher levels of research and look at effects of treatments, in other words, changed behaviors as a result of education.

Figure 1.   The Nine Topic Areas

Topic	Content Area	Number of Articles
1	Unethical Actions	27
2	How Ethical Are We?	16
3	How to do the Right Thing	12
4	Company Values	6
5	Ethics and Leadership	9
6	Codes of Ethics, the Need for and How to Develop Them	19
7	Ethics for Hospitality Educators	4
8	Teaching Ethics	18
9	Tourism Ethics	6

Figure 2.   The Number and Year of Each Article Written on the Particular Topic for the Particular Journal.

Journal	Topic 1	Topic 2	Topic 3	Topic 4	Topic 5	Topic 6	Topic 7	Topic 8	Topic 9	Totals
Successful Meetings	91 92-2 94 96 97 98	92 93 99-2	96-2			99				14
Meetings & Conventions	92 93 94 96	94 97	93 98			93				9
Hospitality & Tourism Educator					91	92	93	91-2 93 94 96		8
Hospitality Research Journal		92		90			92-2 94	90-3		8
Meeting News	90-2 91-3 92		92-2			90				9
Cornell Hotel & Restaurant Administration Quarterly		93 99			94	92		00-2		6
International Journal of Hospitality Management				90-2 91		97		90	92	6
Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education		97 99						98 99-2		5
Bottomline	94	91				91-2 94				5
FIU Hospitality Review		92 94 99			97					4
Nation's Restaurant News			92 99			92 93				4

										Total
Annals of Tourism Research									93 95 99	3
Food Management			92		99	95				3
Int'l Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management					98	00		98		3
Journal of Travel Research					95	93			98	3
Restaurant Business	92-2 96									3
Hotel & Motel Management	90 99									2
Hotel & Resort Industry			94			92				2
Hotels					97	92				2
International Gaming & Wagering Business	96									1
Lodging					97	98				2
Restaurants USA	93		92							2
Tourism Management						98			95	2
Cooking for Profit				94				94		2
Contemp. Hospitality Mgt.					99					1
Hospitality Education & Research Journal								89		1
Hosteur						95				1
Hotel/Motel Security Mgmt.	90									1
HSMAI Marketing Review			96							1
Journal of Foodservice Systems						91				1
Lodging Magazine		91								1
Night Club & Bar Magazine								91		1
Restaurants & Institutions	94									1
Totals	27	16	12	6	9	19	4	18	6	117

Figure 3.   Total Number of Articles on Ethics in Each Year 1990-2000

Number

Year	**of Articles**
1998	1 (indexed with 1990)
1990	12
1991	14
1992	22
1993	11
1994	13
1995	5
1996	8
1997	7
1998	8
1999	13
2000	3 (not a full year)

TOTAL 117

117 Hospitality Journal Articles on Ethics (1990-2000)
    Divided into categories by topics that emerged from the articles:

Unethical Actions (27 articles)

Alva, M. (1992). Insights: Bilking tourists: Big apple restaurants cited for deceptions [charging tourists higher prices]. Restaurant Business. 9(4), 44.

Bernstein, C. (1994). Succession dilemma: No easy way: A founding officer should be allowed to exit as gracefully as possible. Restaurants & Institutions. 104(3), 14.

Brooks, S. (1992). The trials of chairman Posner. Restaurant Business. 9(8), 88.

Butler, C. (1991). The party's over: Planners can no longer ignore liquor liability. Here are the sobering facts. Successful Meetings. 40(12), 32+.

Carr, D. (1992). A confidential list names the worst fam abusers: LACVB is seeking legal action. Meeting News. 16(10), 1,8,12,44.

Conlin, J. (1992). In my opinion: Loose lips: In an ethics investigation, the issue of confidentiality should not be taken lightly. Successful Meetings. 41(2), 26.

Conlin, J. (1992). Truth in numbers: While the trade show industry has grown up. Show managers are still crying: Why must we audit our shows? Successful Meetings. 41(6), part 1 p. 80+.

Crystal, S. (1993). Hotels: When they foist off their favored suppliers. Meetings & Conventions. 28(1), 76-91.

Fisher's law: #138: A question of ethics, part II (1993). Restaurants USA. 13(4), 44.

Ghitelman, D. (1994). Cover story: The big rip-off: Planner Kathleen Tompkins stole a million bucks from her employer. Meetings & Conventions. 29(13), 50-54.

Gillette, B. (1990). Checking out: Illinois agency has good intentions but bad ideas. Hotel & Motel Management. 205(19), A-l 58.

Grimaldi, L. (1996). Incentives: "That was my idea!": What to do when a client takes your proposal and gives the job to someone else. Meetings & Conventions. 31(1), 33+.

Hiday, J. L. (1996). United Kingdom: GTECH & Branson: A UK morality play. International Gamine & Wagering Business. 17(4), 1

Jensen, M. (1994). News: Hotel points: Questionable practice thrives: Who offers points for booking meetings? Successful Meetings. 43(12), Part I p. 11.

Ligos, M. (1998). News: Disclosure: The dispute continues [kickbacks in meetings industry]. Successful Meetings. 47(3), 17-18.

Ligos, M. J. (1996). Successful methods: The meeting planner's legal handbook. Successful Meetings. 45(12), 94-95.

Ligos, M. J. (1997). Cover story: Shady dealings: Unethical behavior. Successful Meetings. 46(4), 42-44, 46-48.

McClain, J. B. (1994). Controllers dance to professional ethics. Bottomline. 9(2), 23.

McNulty, M. A. (1990). Room rate rebates: A legitimate way to fund meetings? Meeting News. 14(5), 1 +.

McNulty, M. A. (1991). FDA, AMA, crack down on medical meetings. Meeting News. 15(13), 7+.

McNulty, M.A. (1991). A bitter pill for M.D. meetings: Meeting sponsorship under fire in health-care industry. Meeting News. 15(1 1), l+.

Newman, R. (1992) Bureau business: The fam scam. Meetings & Conventions. 27(8), 14.

Nichols, D. (1996). Marketing: Truth in advertising? (Dubious advertisements). Restaurant Business. 95(12), 40-42.

O'Brien, J. (1990). Exploring an ethical quagmire: Planner feedback reveals no consensus regarding hotel gifts. Meeting News. 14(14), 9.

Seal, K. (1999). San Diego's mayor exonerated in tourism-funding controversy. Hotel & Motel Management. 214(14), 2 1,143.

Special report: Whistleblowing and the security director: An update. (1990). Hotel/Motel Security Management. 8(4), 5-9.

Weiland, R. (1991). Just say no: Planners cry foul at hotel's surcharges on outside contracts. Meeting News. 15(13), l+.

How Ethical are we?   (16 articles)

Casado, M. A., Miller, W. E., & Vallen, G. K. (1994). Ethical challenges of the industry: Are graduates prepared? FIU Hospitality Review. 12(1), l-7.

Conlin, J. (1992). Special report on industry ethics: let's make a deal: The meetings industry has become increasingly concerned about its ethics. Is there cause? Successful Meetings. 41(2), 36+.

Damitio, J. W., & Schmidgall, R. S. (1993). Ethics: Hospitality professionals' responses to ethical situations: Seven situations with ethical implications were presented to GMs, controllers, and club managers to determine whether there was agreement regarding what is and isn't acceptable behavior. Cornell Hotel & Restaurant Administration Quarterly, 34(4), 40-43.

Edelstein, L. G. (1994). Newsline: Of right and wrong: Ethics poll raises questions. Meetings & Conventions. 29(8), 16-l 7.

Enghagen, L. K., & Hott, D. D. (1992). Students' perceptions of ethical issues in the hospitality and tourism industry. Hospitality Research Journal. 15(2), 41-50.

Ghiselli, R. F. (1999). The ethical inclination of foodservice managers and hospitality students. Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education. 11(2-3), 92-98.

Ligos, M. (1999). True confessions: Begging, borrowing, and...stealing? Successful Meetings. 48(12), 34-36,38-40.

Meyers, C. (1999). News: Ethics takes center stage. Successful Meetings. 48(5), 15.

Schmidgall, R. S. (1992). Hotel managers' responses to ethical dilemmas. FIU Hospitality Review. 10(1), 1 1- 18.

Schmidgall, R., & Damitio, J. (1991). How ethical are hospitality financial managers?: The LAHA report. Bottomline. 6(4), 16- 19.

Schnidgall, R. S. (1991). Human resources: Hotel scruples. Lodging Magazine. 16(5), 388-40.

Stevens, B. (1999). Hotel human resources directors identify ethical issues. FIU Hospitality Review. 17(1-2), 1 l-20.

Stevens, B., & Fleckenstein, A. (1999). Comparative ethics: How students and human-resources directors react to real-life situations. Cornell Hotel & Restaurant Administration Quarterly. 40(2), 69-75.

Sturken, C. A. (1997). On the job: What's your ethics IQ? Meetings & Conventions. 32(9), 49-52, 54-56.

Weaver, P., Choi, J., & Kaufman, T. J. (1997). Question wording and response bias: Students' perceptions of ethical issues in the hospitality and tourism industry. Journal of Hospitality& Tourism Education. 9(2), 21-26.

Your ethics quotient (1993). Successful Meetings. 42(2), 47.

How to do the Right Thing (12 articles)

Adams, M. (1996). Cover story: Doing the right thing [ethics]. Successful Meetings. 45(8), 34-37.

Bloch, J. W. (1992). How ethical is our behavior? Foodservice associations should examine their codes of ethics and see how they can be improved, properly applied and made enforceable. Food Management. 27(8), 28-29.

Eisenstodt, J. (1992). Meeting manager's workbook: Ethical answers to tough questions: Doing the right thing. Meeting News. 16(8), 24.

Eisenstodt, J. (1992). Meeting manager's workbook: The answers to ethical questions aren't always clear: What's right? What's wrong? Meeting News. 16(7), 19.

Feltenstein, T. (1999). Opinion: Marketing with integrity is more than an oxymoron, it's a better way to do business. Nation's Restaurant News. 33(20), 30,34.

Fisher's law: #127: A question of ethics. (1992). Restaurants USA. 12(4), 35.

Griffin, E. (1993). Meeting matters: The ethical dilemma. Meetings & Conventions. 28(12), part 1 p. 18.

Lenhart, M. (1998). Cover story: Can you be bought?: When supplier perks become planner payoffs. Meetings & Conventions. 33(3), 66-68,70,72,75.

McCarthy, R. T. (1996). The way I see it: It's time to look at industry ethics. HSMAI Marketing Review. 13(1), 47-48.

McCarthy, T. T. (1994). Marketing & sales: Fair rates improve profits and image: Many salespeople were forced into unethical or borderline situations in the keenly competitive times faced during the recession. Hotel & Resort Industry. 17(91), 12-1 3.

McDonald, T. (1996). Real results: To tell the truth: In business, honesty really is the best policy. Successful Meetings. 45(3), 26.

Patterson, P. (1992). Purchasing: Tis the season of gift giving, a time to show appreciation. Nation's Restaurant News. 26(47), 128.

Company Values   (6 articles)

Costello, T. (1994, Dec. 15). Management: What's driving your managers?: Are values being cured in the race for good numbers? Cooking for Profit. 523, 13.

Goli, G. (1990). Management by values: Consistency as a predictor of success. Hospitality Research Journal. 14(1), 55-68.

Lefever, M. M., & Reich, A. Z. (1991) Viewpoint: Shared values: No longer dirty words in company success. International Journal of Hospitality Management. 10(4), 307-3 12.

McCleary, D. W., & Vosburgh, R. M. (1990). Towards a better understanding of the value systems of food service managers and hospitality students. Intl. Journal of Hospitality Management. 9(2), 1 1 1- 123.

Stevens, B. (1997). Human resources: Organizational ethics. Lodging. 23(3), 37-38.

Whitney, D. L. (1990). Ethics in the hospitality industry: With a focus on hotel managers. Intl. Journal of Hospitality Management. 9(1), 59-68.

Ethics and Leadership   (9 articles)

Bethel, S. M. (1999). Leadership: A leader has high ethics. Food Management. 34(7), 36.

Fisher, W. P. (1998). Fisher's law: E.T.H.I.C.S.: The qualities that drive successful people. Lodging. 23(11).

Ghiselli, R., & Ismail, J. A. (1999). Promoting organizational effectiveness by defining managerial conduct. Contemporary Hospitality Management. 11(6), 294-302.

Kapoor, T. (1991). A new look at ethics and its relationship to empowerment Hospitality & Tourism Educator. 4(1), 2 1 - 14.

Peceri, M. (1997). IR&RA report: Ethics and hospitality. Hotels. 31(10), 60.

Tracey, J. B., & Hinkin, T. R. (1994). Transformational leaders in the hospitality industry. Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly. 35(2), 18-24.

Upchurch, R. S., & Ruhland, S. K. (1995). An analysis of ethical work climate and leadership relationship in lodging operations. Journal of Travel Research. 34(2), 36-42.

Walczak, D. (1997). The proletarian gourmet [ethics and chefs]. FIU Hospitality Review. 15(2), 27-34.

Wong, S. C. K. (1998). Staff job-related ethics of hotel employees in Hong Kong. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management. 10(2-3), 107- 115.

Codes of Ethics, Need For & How to Develop Them   (19 articles)

Alderson, M. (1994). MIS: Developing a code of ethics for an information technology department: If you ask 20 people you pass in the hall to define "ethics" or "ethical behavior," you will more than likely get 20 different answers. Bottomline. 9(3), 1 O+.

Allen, R. L. 1992. IFA updates code of ethics, approved new advisory council. Nation's Restaurant News. 26(49), 1+.

Axline, L. (1991). Good ethics is good business: Implementing an ethics program is good for your bottom line. Bottomline. 6(4), 12+.

Beasley, M. A. (1995). Bottom line: Developing a code of ethics. Food Management. 30(5), 40-4 1.

D'Amore, L. J. (1993). Research notes & communications: A code of ethics and guidelines for socially and environmentally responsible tourism. Journal of Travel Research. 31(3), 64-66.

Fox, J. (2000). Approaching managerial ethical standards in Croatia's hotel industry. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management. 12(1), 70-74.

Guest editorial: The question of global ethics. (1992). Cornell Hotel & Restaurant Administration Quarterly. 66(6), 96.

Hayes, J. (1993). News: Atlanta operators draft code for Olympics. Nation's Restaurant News. 27(45), 8.

Hogan, J. (1992). The front line: Ethics shouldn't sway during tough times. Hotel & Resort Industry. 15(5), 44-45.

IAEM on ethics: It's a private affair. (1999). Successful Meetings. 48(2), 16.

Kapoor, R. (1992). Forum: Developing, implementing, and adhering to a code of ethics. Hospitality & Tourism Educator. 4(3), 59-64.

Lerman, J. (1990). Hotel gifts: Payola or perks? Meeting News. 14(1 1), 1+.

Malloy, D. C., & Fenell, D. A (1998). Codes of ethics and tourism: An exploratory content analysis. Tourism Management. 19(5), 453-461.

Sawyer, C. (1991). Foodservice professional organizations: Codes of ethics. Journal of Foodservice Systems. 6(1). 23-25.

Schaefer, C. J. (1991). Between the lines: Putting ethics in business. Bottomline, 6(4), 5 .

Stevens, B. (1997). Hotel ethical codes: A content analysis. International Journal of Hospitality Management. 16(3), 26 l-271.

Vallen, G., & Miller, W. (1995). A question of ethics: Ethical principles in hospitality management. Hosteur. 4(2), 3 1.

Weinstein, R. (1993). Ethics: Keeping the peace. Meetings & Conventions. 28(10), supp 34-43.

Wolfe, G. A. (1992). Training: Ethics on the job. Hotels. 26(4), 39.

Ethics for Hospitalitv Educators (codes & their orientations) (4 articles)

Damitio, J. W., Whitney, D. L., & Schmidgall, R. S. (1992). Ethical orientation of hospitality educators. Hospitalitv Research Journal. 16(1), 75-92.

Farrar, A. L., & Kwansa, F. A. (1993). Professionalization, ethics, and the hospitality educator. Hospitality & Tourism Educator. 5(3), 55-49.

Kwansa, F. A., & Farrar, A. L. (1992). A conceptual framework for developing a hospitality educators' code of ethics. Hospitalitv Research Journal. 15(3), 27-39.

McCleary, K. W. (1994). Ethics in academic publication. Hospitality Research Journal. 18(1), 139-148.

Teaching Ethics (18 articles)

Christy, C., & Colman, V. (1991). Last call: Explore the debate for the '90s" Industrial ethics. Night Club & Bar Magazine. 7(5), 22-25.

Costello, T., (1994). Making the tough choices: Do you persevere, compromise or ignore? Cooking For Profit. 5(23), 13.

Enghagen, L. K. (1990). Ethics in hospitality/tourism education: A survey. Hospitalitv Research Journal, 14(2), 113-l 18.

Enghagen, L. K. (1990). Teaching ethics in hospitality & tourism education. Hospitality Research Journal. 14(2), 467-474.

Enghagen, L. K. (1993). Recognizing ethical issues or people who live in glass houses. Hospitalitv & Tourism Educator. 5(2), 69-7 1.

Freeman, A. M., & Bartholomew, P. S. (1990). Age/experience and gender as factors in ethical development of hospitality managers and students. Hospitality Research Journal. 14(2), 1-10.

Hegarty, J. A. (1990). Ethics in hospitality education. Intl. Journal of Hospital&v Management. 9(2), 106- 109.

Khan, M. M., & McCleary, K. W. (1996). A proposed model for teaching ethics in hospitality. Hospitalitv & Tourism Educator. 8(4), 7-1 1.

Lieux, E. M. & Winquist, S. C. (1991). Instruction in writing combined with an introduction to ethics in a professional discipline. Hospitalitv & Tourism Educator. 3(2), 34-35.

Lundberg, C. C. (1994). Topic paper: The views of future hospitality leaders on business ethics. Hosnitalitv & Tourism Educator. 6(2), 1 1 - 13.

March, L. & Schmidgall, R. J. (1999). Teaching legal and ethic issues: Where does tip reporting fit?. Journal of Hospital&v & Tourism Education. 11(2-3). 60-63.

Martin, L. J. (1998). Integrating ethics into the hospitality curriculum. Journal of Hospitalitv & Tourism Education. 10(2), 22-25.

O'Halloran, R. M. (199 1). Ethics in hospitality and tourism education: The new managers. Hosnitalitv & Tourism Educator. 3(3), 33.

Stevens, B. (1999). Fostering volunteerism: A course in managerial communication and ethics. Journal of Hospitalitv & Tourism Education. 11(2-3), 50-53.

Stevens, B., & Brownwell, J. (2000). Communicating standards and influencing behavior. Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Ouarterly. 41(2), 39-43.

Upchurch, R. S. (1998). Ethics in the hospitality industry: An applied model. International Journal of Contemnorarv Hospitality Management. 10(6), 227-233.

Vallen, G. & Casado, M. (2000). Ethical principles for the hospitality curriculum. Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly. 41(2), 44-5 1/

Whitney, D. L. (1989). The ethical orientations of hotel managers and hospitality students: Implications for industry, education, and youthful careers. Hospitalitv Education & Research Journal. 13(3), 187-192.

Tourism Ethics & Eco-Tourism   (**6** articles)

Fennell, D. A., & Malloy, D. C. (1999). Measuring the ethical nature of tourism operators. Annals of Tourism Research. 26(4), 928-943.

Hegarty, J. A. (1992). Discussion papers: Towards establishing a new paradigm for tourism and hospitality developments. International Journal of Hospitalitv Management. 11(4), 309-3 17.

Hultsman, J. (1995). Just tourism: an ethical framework. Annals of Tourism Research. 22(3), 553-567.

Lea, J. P. (1993). Tourism development ethics in the third world. Annals of Tourism Research, 20(4), 70 l-7 15.

Malloy, D. C., & Fennell, D. (1998). Ecotourism and ethics: Moral development and organizational cultures. Journal of Travel Research. 36(4), 47-56.

Walle, A. H. (1995). Current issues: Business ethics and tourism: From micro to macro perspectives. Tourism Management. 16(4), 263-268.